Fall 2003 Volume V

Alliance for the Study of Adoption, Identity & Kinship

Alliance sponsors session at MLA 2003

Emily Hipchen will chair a special session, "Adopting Identities: Race, Nationality, and the Trans-ethnic Adoption Narrative" at this year's Modern Language Association Convention, 7:15pm on December 29 in the Leucadia Room at the San Diego Marriot Hotel.

The session explores the ways trans-ethnic adoption in auto/biographical texts complicates the adoptee's – and ultimately the reader's – understanding of race, ethnicity and nation. Three papers were chosen to blend practical critical study of specific narratives with more broadly theoretical questions about the interplay between individual and cultural identity constructed around trans-ethnic adoption.

Darcy Ballantyne's essay, "The Implication of Interracial Kin Adoptions for Black Identity Formation," addresses the informal adoption by kin of the interracial

child. It develops the premise that Canadian filmmaker Lawrence Green's autobiography, *Reconstruction*, centers around his adopted "black" sister's identity formation. Ballantyne theorizes that the formation of a narrative in circumstances where "non-conformity to hegemonic norms" prevails is particularly complex with regard to race, individual identity, and even nation. Ballantyne is a graduate student at York University, working on black culture in Canada and adoption autobiography.

Ruth Haber's "Adopted Children; Adopted Countries?" uses current work on Victorian racial theories to discuss trans-ethnic adoption in nineteenth-century British fictional auto/biography. In these examples, children of French, Italian, and Jewish descent were adopted and educated into "Englishness," in order to "cure" them of the "defects" of their foreign birth. (Continued on page 2)

Commentary: The Magdalene Sisters in America



Contents:	:	
Teaching Adoption Course Descriptions Poem by Jan Beatty Member News Listerv Information Membership Renewal	2 5 7 7 8 9	

By James M. Smith Boston College

Peter Mullan's award-winning movie *The Magdalene Sisters* opened throughout the United States this past August. Later the same month, *The Irish Times* revealed disturbing details regarding the exhumation, cremation, and reburial of 155 Irish women who had lived and died at the High Park Magdalen Asylum operated by the Sisters of Our Lady of Charity of Refuge in Dublin. Buried anonymously between 1866 and 1984, these women were denied a final resting place even in death. Back in 1993, when the exhumations occurred, the Sisters did seek a license from the Irish State. However, the license only listed 133 sets of remains. Moreover, death certificates, legally required in Ireland, were missing in some 58 cases. In a further 24 cases, the nuns could not even produce the woman's name. And now it is revealed that there are 22 bodies that can't be accounted for.

One would hope that such irregularities might raise a red flag, draw the attention of a government official, or perhaps lead to a police investigation. But in Ireland, this was not to be the case. Instead, the State provided the nuns with a hastily re-issued license and the bodies were re-interred anonymously at Dublin's Glasnevin cemetery. Cremation, of course, destroys all trace of historical

(Continued on page 3)

Alliance at MLA 2003 (cont.)



Join us at MLA this December in sunny San Diego!

The trope of the trans-ethnic adoption in Victorian fiction, Haber argues, not only expresses Victorian beliefs about the "nature of race and the role of heredity in identity formation," but also frames heredity as nation interviews and autobiographies for the or culture, one with moral and political implications. Haber's past projects include her dissertation, Looking Backward: The Novel of the Recent Past in Victorian Fiction and other writings on Victorian culture, class, and the role of the disabled in nineteenthcentury literature.

The politics of trans-ethnic adoption are foregrounded against the chaos of ideological conflict in Jason Owens' "Adoption and Adaptation: Namibia's GDR Kids." Over 400 of the Cassinga Orphans, casualties of a South African attack on a Namibian refugee camp in Angola in 1978, were "adopted" by East Germany. They spent more than a decade of their lives living in Europe where they were educated for a return to a new, communist Namibia.

Originally fleeing from apartheid in Namibia, these children ultimately enact and subvert that policy.

Owen's paper examines the GDR Kids' societal and legal implications of group transgression of "familiar apartheid categories." Owens has studied and written extensively on the "GDR Kids" and currently has a book on the subject under review.

Marianne Novy, Professor of English at University of Pittsburgh and Alliance cochair, will serve as respondent.

> A brief business meeting will preceed the panel at MLA, 7pm, Leucadia Room, San Diego Marriot

Teaching Adoption in the Humanities

Topics like "adoption" "identity" and "kinship" are appearing in course descriptions in an increasing number of college and university course catalogues. Whether part of introductory topicbased courses or advanced graduate seminars, adoption studies in the humanities is proliferating. Instructors from a variety of backgrounds and specialties recognize adoption in literature and culture as an in-road for students to sharpen critical skills and examine the politics of identity.

Marianne Novy, Jill Deans, Cynthia Callahan, Susan Schultz and Laura Schattchneider have all recently taught, or are teaching, courses on adoption in the humanities. For those interested in developing their own course, each has provided a sample description and booklist (see page 6).

Marianne Novy has taught "Adoption in Literature" for both undergraduate and graduate students at the University of Pittsburgh. Cynthia Callanhan developed a course titled, "The Culture of Adoption in America" for undergraduates at Trinity College in Hartford, CT.

Jill Deans has taught numerous adoptionthemed courses, including a topic-based undergraduate course, "Family in Literature," an honor's writing seminar with the same title, and a graduate cultural studies seminar called "Adoption in Literature and Culture," all at Kansas State University. She is currently teaching freshman writing seminars that include units on adoption literature at Bryn Mawr and Haverford Colleges.

Before embarking on her new career in adoption law, Laura Schattschneider taught a course on foundling narratives at UCLA. And Susan Schultz' course, "Literature of Adoption" is listed as a Junior Honors course at the University of Hawai'i.

This Spring, at the 2004 NEMLA conference in Pittsburgh (Mar. 2-4), Marianne, Jill and Cynthia will hold a roundtable discussion on teaching adoption in literature.

(Continued on page 6)

Magdalene Sisters (cont.)

evidence, and thus no one will ever know with certainty who exactly is buried at the Glasnevin plot. The history of Ireland's Magdalen Asylums is incomplete, and the still emerging facts are even stranger than the fiction of Mullan's movie.

The Magdalene Sisters is shocking in its own right. The film follows the stories of four young Irish women incarcerated in a Magdalen Asylum. Most "penitents" were sent to the Magdalen for that peculiarly Irish sin, perceived "sexual immorality"—they were single mothers, the victims of incest and rape, or they were prostitutes. Other women and young girls were deemed too attractive or merely "simple," and were hastily hidden away, ostensibly to safeguard their moral purity.

With no official sentence, and thus no mandated release, some of these women lived and died behind convent walls. There was no judge and no jury. Throughout the last two hundred years, 30,000 Irish women purged their sins by washing society's dirty laundry; spiritual renewal was achieved through back-breaking labor, endless prayer, and the complete effacement of individual identity. The final "Magdalen Laundry," as they became known, closed its doors in 1996.

I first viewed *The Magdalene Sisters* last summer while conducting research at the Irish Film Institute in Dublin. Since then, responses to the movie have exploded across Europe, ensuring its success at Irish and British cinemas. One year later, however, the film's American release provokes the truly disturbing, but frequently evaded, question for Irish society: has *The Magdalene Sisters* yielded an appropriate response to this scandal?

Has Mullan's movie, to put the question another way, joined the list of previous cultural representations appearing in the last decade—including film documentaries and dramas, theatrical productions, radio and television talk shows, popular fiction, and musical lyrics— already disseminating a partial history of Ireland's Magdalen

institutions without generating any social action? If, as recent publicity assures us, one in four Irish people saw this film, what is the moral and cultural pay off? Has the recent culture of exposure — a seeming litany of social and political scandals — desensitized Ireland? Or will this horror, unlike the industrial and reformatory schools or clerical pedophilia scandals, fail to initiate real action: apologies, commissions of inquiry, appropriate monuments and memorials, or calls for reparations?

In his US interviews, Peter Mullan challenges the religious orders to provide survivors and interested family members with the gift of information: the inmate's name at the time of entry as well as her appointed name while incarcerated, information about where inmates were placed after dismissal, any health background to help adopted children fill in their medical pasts, and, finally, details about the burial sites of those who died while still incarcerated.

As with similar demands from victims of the child sexual abuse, such requests have been met by the Church's regime of secrecy, denial, and obfuscation. This vacuum, created by the collective resistance of the Good Shepherd Sisters, The Sisters of Our Lady of Charity of Refuge, and the Mercy Sisters, once again humiliates, diminishes, and dismisses survivors and their families.

In light of such resistance, it is perhaps understandable that American commentators see *The Magdalene Sisters* as another indictment of the Catholic Church, implying that responsibility lies with the nuns, and the nuns alone. The movie arrives on the American big screen in the wake of an almost two-year media frenzy that has pursued revelations of clerical child sex abuse across virtually every Catholic diocese in the United States. This backdrop of controversy will, no doubt, ensure a ready and receptive audience. But, it is also likely to detract from the film's particular cultural challenge.

"Peter Mullan challenges the religious orders to provide survivors and interested family members with the gift of information."



from Peter Mullan's The Magdalene Sisters

Magdalene Sisters (cont.)

Mullan's camera knowingly challenges the Irish public, implicating them as responsible agents in the betrayal and mistreatment of the women represented on screen. The convent's poignantly green delivery van feeds dirty laundry from the nation's well-to-do families and public institutions to bolster the institution's coffers. Margaret's and Rose's family, each aided by a Catholic priest, arrange for the quick disappearance of a daughter for fear she might tarnish the respectable character of the home.

The message confronts each and every viewer: no woman entered an Irish Magdalen without a family member, an employer, a neighbor or friend, knowing of their prior existence. Only Irish society can decide whether to make public its collusion in these oppressive *oubliettes* that rendered generations of Magdalen women the nation's disappeared. Thus far, it has refused to do so.

The American response to the movie also ignores the State's culpability in the Magdalen scandal. The film's Corpus Christi procession depicts this culpability as members of An Garda Síochána (Ireland's police force) escort the Magdalen women on this very public display of the nun's piety. In this particular instance, the film replicates a historic photograph depicting real-life Magdalens from the Gloucester Street Asylum parading down Sean McDermott Street in 1950s' Dublin. And, there in the photograph for all the world to see, columns of police marshal both sides of the thirty or so women.

Surely this photograph requires some explanation. If, as the religious orders maintain, women voluntarily entered these institutions, why then a police escort? If, as the Irish government maintains, the Magdalen Asylums were private religious institutions outside State control, why deploy the nation's police to enforce a form of imprisonment inconsistent with the judicial and constitutional rights afforded all Irish citizens? Can Ireland's minister for justice or the current Commissioner point to the legislative authority by which the Garda Siochána performed these duties?

There is a long and as yet unacknowledged history of State collusion in Ireland's Magdalen Laundries. Throughout the twentieth century, these

institutions absolved the State's obligation to provide for diverse populations of "problem" women — beyond those represented in Mullan's movie. These included women found guilty of infanticide in the courts, young victims of sexual crime refused entry to the State's industrial and reformatory schools, women under the age of 21 on remand and awaiting trial, and, as the Kennedy Report pointed out in 1970, wards of the State transferred illegally from the industrial school to the Magdalen Laundry. And, in some such cases, the State funded the religious orders.

Can the Irish government now demonstrate that women entering the Magdalen Asylums under the auspices of the State ever left these institutions, especially in light of the religious orders' competing financial interest in maintaining its population of free and exploitable labor? Might some of these State committals be among those buried anonymously in Glasnevin cemetery?

As historians Maria Luddy and Frances Finnegan intimate, the historical record for this aspect of Ireland's past will never be complete until the religious orders make available their archival records. Ironically, because Ireland's Magdalen Laundries exist in the public mind at the level of story (survivor testimony and cultural representation) rather than history (archival records and documentation), the Irish religious orders, not the Irish State or the Irish public, remain at the center of national and international opprobrium. Consequently, the demands for a governmental admission of culpability or a communal admission of collusion are diluted.

No one in Ireland, not church, not state, not community, will admit responsibility for the scandal. As long as this remains the case, discussions of *The Magdalene Sisters* must continue to privilege the film's specific, and as yet unfinished, Irish cultural context.

James M. Smith is Assistant Professor of English at Boston College where he specializes in Irish literature and culture.

Course Descriptions & Booklists

Literature of Adoption Susan M. Schultz (schultz@hawaii.rr.com) University of Hawai'i

Contemporary debates about "the family" are often conducted by way of public discussions of adoption. Since adopted families are considered more "constructed" or even "fictional" than "natural," they are regarded paradoxically: on the one



hand, adoption is seen as the "solution" to social ills; on the other, it is seen as a highly problematic system of last resort, for parents and for children. These debates have been staged, quite literally or literarily, in world literature. While I expect this course to draw students who have been touched in some ways by adoption, I encourage anyone interested in literature about the family to take it. Adoption makes conscious often unconscious assumptions that western culture has toward family, kinship, and community. We will look into non-western views of adoption, as well, including the Hawaiian practice of *hanai*. These assumptions, and the identity issues they raise, are the business of us all, not simply those of us who live in adoptive families.

Book/film list: Sophocles, Oedipus Rex; George Eliot, Silas Marner, Charles Dickens, Great Expectations; Rudyard Kipling, The Jungle Book; Edward Albee, The American Dream; Sherman Alexie, Indian Killer, Jackie Kay, The Adoption Papers; E.B. White, Charlotte's Web; Caryl Churchill, A Number, Craig Watson, True News.

Adoption Literature Marianne Novy (mnovy+@pitt.edu) University of Pittsburgh

This course will examine how literature has portrayed adoption, adoptees, adoptive parents, and birth parents. Though adoption varies widely in different historical periods, its portrayal often involves similar conflicts between heredity and nurture, similar debates about how to define "parents" and "family." We will analyze textual treatments of such conflicts and other issues, and show how adoption literature involves questions about identity, "self," community, class, ethnicity, nation, gender, and sexuality. We will also consider representations of adoption in autobiography and children's literature, and related material from popular culture, film, video, and ethnographic and historical research.

Reading List: Shakespeare, A Winter's Tale; George Eliot, Silas Marner, Barbara Kingsolver, The Bean Trees and Pigs in Heaven; Jeanette Winterson, Oranges Are Not the Only Fruit; Edward Albee, The American Dream; Jackie Kay, The Adoption Papers; Betty Jean Lifton, Twice Born; Jane Anderson, The Baby Dance; Margaret Moorman, Waiting to Forget, Lucy Maude Montgomery, Anne of Green Gables; Chang-Rae Lee, A Gesture Life; Susan Ito and Tina Cervin, Ghost at Heart's Edge; critical material by Julie Berebitsky, Barbara Melosh, Katarina Wegar, Sandra Patton, Martha Satz, Judith Modell, E. Wayne Carp, and visit from Molly Shanley, author of Making Babies, Making Families.

Foundling Narratives Laura Schattschneider (now at NYU school of law; les291@nyu.edu) UCLA

Representations of abandoned children, or foundlings, abound in 18th- and early 19th-century European fiction. In many texts, foundlings are taken in and cared for by people unrelated to them. In this course, we will ask how such narratives correspond to the ways abandoned children were really cared for during this

period of social revolution. We will investigate whether and to what extent representations of foundling welfare expose the emotional underpinnings of a civic culture newly troubled by republican reformulations of sympathy. We will also address the ways stories of children in distress still shape European and American notions of citizens' responsibilities to each other.

Booklist: Sophocles, Oedipus Tyrannos; the Moses narrative from Exodus; Henry Fielding, Tom Jones; excerpt from Eliza Haywood, The Fortunate Foundlings; excerpts from Rousseau, Emile, and The Social Contract; Mary Robinson, The Natural Daughter, Charles Dickens, Oliver Twist; P.J.A. Feuerbach, Example of a Crime Against the Life of the Human Soul; 2 films on Kaspar Hauser; Werner Herzog, Jeder fuer sich und Gott gegen Alle; Peter Sehr, Kaspar Hauser, Neal Stephenson, The Diamond Age; a reader on Hobbes and Locke on the social contract and the parent-child relationship; excerpts from Hume and Smith on sympathy; excerpts from two histories of the London Foundling Hospital, one primary source by the Hospital's recording secretary in the 19th century, and one 1926 history by R.H. Nichols and F.A. Wray.

Culture of Adoption in America Cynthia Callahan (now at James Madison U; callahca@jmu.edu) Trinity College

While adoption has been an important part of American family life since the 19th century, it has recently become a matter of public fascination for contemporary Americans. From adoptive mother Rosie O'Donnell to the growing number of Chinese baby girls adopted by Americans to the "Internet Twins" – essentially sold by an adoption broker over the internet – adoption invites all Americans to contemplate issues of family belonging, cultural identity, and national responsibility. In this class, we will view adoption through a variety of lenses, examining fiction, popular psychology, film, and history to study the impact of adoption on racial, gender, and national identity.

Texts include: fiction by Bharati Mukherjee, Barbara Kingsolver, Charles Chesnutt; excerpts from adoption histories, Linda Gordon's *The Great Arizona Orphan Abduction* and Rickie Solinger's *Wake Up Little Susie*; films such as *Flirting with Disaster*, *Mighty Aphrodite*, *Catfish and Black Bean Sauce*.

Adoption in Literature and Culture Jill R. Deans (now at Haverford College; jrdeans@mac.com) Kansas State University

This course is an examination of representations of adoption in literature and culture throughout the twentieth century (and beyond). It should appeal not only to those with specific interests in adoption as a social institution, but also to those interested in identity and cultural studies in general. As you will soon discover, representations of adoption often serve as metaphors for displacement, multiplicity, boundary crossing, and new possibilities in identity formation and recognition. As we explore the texts, social history and context of adoption, I encourage you to apply your understanding of this topic to your individual interests. You may find some surprising connections.

Booklist: Charles Chesnutt, *The Quarry*; William Faulkner, *Light in August*; E. Wayne Carp, *Family Secrets: History of Adoption and Sealed Records*; Rickie Solinger, *Wake Up Little Susie*; Betty Jean Lifton, *Twice Born*; Susan Ito and Tina Cervin, *Ghost at Heart's Edge*; Sherman Alexie, *Indian Killer*, Barbara Kingsolver, *Pigs in Heaven*; Dan Savage, *The Kid*; Bharati Mukherjee, *Leave It to Me*; Sara Lewis, *The Answer is Yes*; Greenhaven Anthology, *Adoption*; criticism by Judith Modell, Laura Doyle, Michel Foucault, Hayden White, Marx, Freud, Trinh Minh-ha, and Drucilla Cornell; films include: *The Kid, The Bad Seed, Our Very Own*, *Finding Christa, Reno Finds Her Mom, Flirting with Disaster*

Member News

Karen Balcom is writing an article for the *Journal of Women's History* on the "new adoption literature," looking at E. Wayne Carp's *Adoption in America: Historical Perspectives*; Rickie Solinger's *Beggars and Choosers: How the Politics of Choice Shapes Adoption, Abortion and Welfare in the United States*; Julie Berebitsky's *Like Our Very Own: Adoption and the Changing Culture of Motherhood*; and Barbara Melosh's *Strangers and Kin: The American Way of Adoption.*

Jan Beatty's poem "Report from the Skinhouse" appears in her second book, *Boneshaker* (U of Pittsburgh P, 2002).

Cynthia Callahan defended her dissertation, *Birth Writes: Transracial Adoptive Identity in American Literature* at the University of Delaware. She is currently Visiting Assistant Professor of English at James Madison University.

Marley Greiner continues her duties as Executive Chair of Bastard Nation. She also publishes "Baby Dump News: A Weekly Chronicle of Newborn Abandonment, Infanticide, Safe Haven Legislation, and Related Issues." Her commentaries on anonymous baby abandonment and identity rights have appeared in newspapers and on adoption about com. She also discussed safe havens on radio talks shows in Racine, WI and Bridgeport, NH and in March appeared on NBC's "John Walsh Show" safe haven program. In March, she participated in the Evan B. Donaldson Adoption Institute Policy Roundtable on Safe Haven Laws in New York City.

Emily Hipchen has moved to Florida where she is now Visiting Associate Professor of English at the University of Tampa. She continues to co-edit *Auto/Biography Studies* and is currently writing about the place of photographs in adoption autobiography.

Marianne Novy's anthology Imagining Adoption: Essays on Literature and Culture was reviewed in the Tulsa Studies "Adoption Issue" and in Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature. It appeared on three people's lists of ten best books on adoption in the birthmother newsletter, Origins, and was one of Choice's academic books of the year. Imagining Adoption will be out in paperback soon. Marianne spoke at

the "Shedding Light on Secrecy and Openness in Adoption" conference in Richmond, VA last May and continues work on her own book on adoption in literature.

Nancy Gish published an article on British experimental poetry, including a discussion of Jackie Kay's *The Adoption Papers*, in *Assembling Alternatives*, ed. Romana Huk (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan UP, 2003).

Laura Schattschneider has an article forthcoming in *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture* 33 (2004) called "The Infants' Petitions: An English Poetics of Foundling Reception, 1741-1837." Having completed two post-doc years at UCLA, Laura is now in Law School at New York University where she is studying foster care policy, kinship and adoption law and international children's rights. She was recently granted a legal internship at the Evan B. Donaldson Adoption Institute.

Report from the Skinhouse

I went looking for the body.

The apple, tree, the river. Gliding voice, curve of arm, pearly blue uterus.

Muscled calf, the neptune green eye, blood with the same taste as mine.

Why do I write my report this way? An adopted child needs to find a face.

What does a real mother's body look like? River, chalkline, bloody cave?

I am replica of nothing.

birthmother, conjurer, boneshaker, witch; let me smell your skin just once, I'll give you your bloody daughter.

Jan Beatty

Member News (cont.)

Carol J. Singley (Rutgers U-Camden) and Caroline Levander (Rice U) have co-edited a book of critical essays entitled *The American Child: A Cultural Studies Reader*, which appeared from Rutgers University Press this October 2003. The book includes their co-authored introduction, which describes the child as site of critical inquiry and explains how narratives of U.S. national identity are persistently configured in the language of childhood and family. Using a range of critical methodologies, contributors to the book address matters of race, gender, and family to chart the ways that representations of the child typify historical periods and conflicting ideas. Grounded in the literary, the volume also draws on other disciplines, revealing that the concepts of "the child" are not isolated artifacts but cultural productions that in turn affect the social climates around them. Essayists look at games, pets, adolescent sexuality, adoption, and other family relations to reveal the complex ways in which the child operates as a rich vehicle for writers to consider evolving ideas of nation and the diverse roles of citizens in it. One essay, in particular, examines adoption: "Transformative Terrains: Korean Adoptees and the Social Constructions of an American Childhood" by Catherine Ceniza Choy and Gregory Paul Choy.

Singley is presently at work on a book analyzing representations of adoption in American literature and culture. She is the mother of two adopted sons, ages 8 and 9.

Adoption in Literature Listserv

Got something to say?



Martha Satz (<u>msatz@smu.edu</u>) hosts the adoption in literature listserv at Southern Methodist University. No, it's not one of those pesky lists that inundates subscribers with trivial commentary. It's simply a venue for posting information, queries and neat ideas about adoption in literature and culture.

To subscribe, send an email message to: <u>majordomo@post.cis.smu.edu</u> In the body of the message, write: subscribe adopt_lit (do not write anything in the subject line). You should receive confirmation if the subscription is successful.

To post a message, email: adopt_lit@list.smu.edu

Membership 2004

Please contribute to the Alliance by keeping your membership active.
Send \$5 to:
Jill Deans, Membership Chair, 6 College La., Haverford, PA 19041 (Please make checks payable to Jill Deans, and write "ASAIK" on the note line).
Please update any of the following information, by sending this form with your check.
Name:
Institutional Affiliation:
Preferred Address:
Email Address:
Would you like to write a book review or short article?
Would you like to recommend any titles for review?
News or suggestions for the next newsletter:



Alliance for the Study of Adoption, Identity & Kinship

Jill R. Deans, Ph.D. 6 College Lane Haverford, PA 19041

jrdeans@mac.com

Executive Committee (2003)

- Marianne Novy (co-chair, University of Pittsburgh)
- Carol J. Singley (co-chair, Rutgers U, Camden)
- Jill R. Deans (co-chair, Haverford College)
- Barbara Melosh (George Mason University)
- Margot Gayle Backus (University of Houston)

For more information about the Alliance, contact Marianne Novy, Department of English, 4700 Fifth Avenue, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA 15260; mnovy+@pitt.edu

Support for the newsletter comes from:

The University of Tampa, Department of English and Rutgers University, Camden, M.A. Program in English

Additional thanks to Emily Hipchen for seeing this edition to its completion.